Review Article

Survey of the Thermodynamic Properties of the Charge Density Wave Systems

M. Saint-Paul and P. Monceau

1 Université Grenoble Alpes, Institut Néel, F-38042 Grenoble, France
2 CNRS, Institut Néel, F-38042 Grenoble, France

Correspondence should be addressed to M. Saint-Paul; michel.saint-paul@neel.cnrs.fr

Received 23 October 2018; Revised 19 December 2018; Accepted 20 January 2019; Published 3 March 2019

We examine the thermodynamic properties such as specific heat, thermal expansion, and elastic constants at the charge density wave (CDW) phase transition in several one- and two-dimensional materials. The amplitude of the specific heat anomaly at the CDW phase transition $T_{CDW}$ increases with increasing $T_{CDW}$ and a tendency to a lineal temperature dependence is verified. The Ehrenfest mean field theory relationships are approximately satisfied by several compounds such as the rare earth tritelluride compound TbTe$_3$, transition metal dichalcogenide compound 2H-NbSe$_2$, and quasi-one-dimensional conductor K$_{0.3}$MoO$_3$. In contrast inconsistency exists in the Ehrenfest relationships with the transition metal dichalcogenide compounds 2H-TaSe$_2$ and TiSe$_2$ having a different thermodynamic behavior at the transition temperature $T_{CDW}$. It seems that elastic properties in the ordered phase of most of the compounds are related to the temperature dependence of the order parameter which follows a BCS behavior.

1. Introduction

The electron density of a low dimensional (one-dimensional (1D) or two-dimensional (2D)) compound may develop a wavelike periodic variation, a charge density wave (CDW), accompanied by a lattice distortion when temperature drops below a critical temperature $T_{CDW}$ [1–46]. CDW ordering is driven by an electron phonon coupling. The concept of charge density wave is related to the initial work of Peierls [1], followed by Fröhlich [2] when it was demonstrated that a one-dimensional metal is instable with respect to a phase transition in the presence of electron phonon coupling.

A charge density wave is characterized by a spatial periodic modulation of the electronic density concomitant with a lattice distortion having the same periodicity. The properties of the CDW state can be described by an order parameter $Q \exp(i\Phi)$ [1]. The fluctuations of the lattice distortions can be described by amplitude and phase modes [1]. This variation, charge density wave, in the electron density is receiving intense study because it often competes with another ground state (superconductivity). A CDW order can be formed with one fixed wave vector or multiple wave vectors. For example, the incommensurate ordering vector $Q_1$ of the prototypical rare earth tritelluride ErTe$_3$ at the upper CDW phase transition $T_{CDW1} = 265$ K is parallel to the $\vec{c}$ axis, whereas the incommensurate ordering parameter $Q_2$ observed at the lower CDW phase transition $T_{CDW2} = 150$ K with ErTe$_3$ is parallel to the $\vec{a}$ axis. In contrast the CDW order in the dichalcogenide compounds (for example, 2H-NbSe$_2$) is formed by three superposed charge density waves.

The origin of the CDW phase transition observed in the two-dimensional materials is still not completely settled [5]. Two alternatives have been proposed for describing the nature of the CDW in the family of rare earth tritelluride RTe$_3$ (R=rare earth element) which represents a charge density model. Based on ARPES measurements [10, 11], one describes it in terms of Fermi surface nesting following the electron Peierls scheme. The other one emphasizes the role of the strongly momentum dependent electron phonon coupling as evidenced from inelastic X-ray scattering [13] and Raman [7, 14] experiments. As the electron phonon coupling is increased the importance of the electronic structure in $k$ space is reduced.
Study of the thermodynamic properties of the charge density wave phase transition in two-dimensional transition metal dichalcogenide compounds [16–25] and in quasi-one-dimensional conductors [26–37] has generated a considerable interest over the past 30 years. The onset of the CDW order has remarkable effects on the thermodynamic properties since below \( T_{\text{CDW}} \) a gap opens up in the density of the electronic states. A microscopic model is given by McMillan [28]. The elastic properties of quasi low dimensional conductors undergoing charge and spin density phase transitions are reviewed by Brill [3]. Several reviews discuss the properties of the charge density wave systems [4–6, 45].

We reexamine the thermodynamic experimental data such as specific heat, thermal expansion, and elastic constants of several CDW compounds. We give a survey of the Ehrenfest relations using the experimental data obtained at the CDW phase transition in different materials: rare earth tritellurides \( \text{RTe}_3 \) (\( \text{TbTe}_3 \), \( \text{ErTe}_3 \), and \( \text{HoTe}_3 \)) [8, 41–43], transition metal dichalcogenides \( \text{MX}_2 \) compounds (2H-NbSe\(_2\) [17–19], 2H-TaSe\(_2\), 2H-TaS\(_2\) [16, 24, 25], and \( \text{TiSe}_2 \)) [20–23]), quasi-one-dimensional conductors (\( \text{NbSe}_3 \)) [25, 27], \( \text{K}_0.3\text{MoO}_3 \) [30–33], \( \text{TaSe}_3 \)) [1, 39, 40], and TTF-TCNQ [35–38]), and in the system \((\text{LaAgSb}_2)\) [44, 45].

Departures from the mean field behavior of the thermodynamic properties are generally attributed to fluctuations which belong to the 3D XY criticality class [27–34]. The contribution of the fluctuations is important in the quasi-one-dimensional conductors [28] and in the transition metal dichalcogenides (2H-TaSe\(_2\), 2H-TaS\(_2\)) [24]. Small fluctuation effects are observed around \( T_{\text{CDW}} \) in the rare earth tritellurides \( \text{TbTe}_3 \) [41] and \( \text{ErTe}_3 \) [42].

The amplitude of the lattice distortion is governed by the electron phonon coupling strength [46]. A moderately strong electron phonon coupling is reported for the rare earth tritellurides (ARPES experiments [10, 11]), similar to that observed in quasi-ID CDW systems such as \( \text{K}_0.3\text{MoO}_3 \) and \( \text{NbSe}_3 \). In a weak coupling CDW, the specific heat behavior at the CDW phase transition is driven by the electronic entropy [28, 46]. In a strong coupling CDW the transition is also governed by the entropy of the lattice [28, 46].

2. Thermodynamic Properties

2.1. Ehrenfest Relations. At a second-order phase transition \( T_C \), the order parameter \( Q \) increases continuously in the ordered phase at \( T < T_C \). The Landau free energy [47] can be written without knowing the microscopic states as

\[
F = F_0 + a(T - T_C) Q^2 + B Q^4, \tag{1}
\]

where \( F_0 \) describes the temperature dependence of the high temperature phase and the constant parameters \( a \) and \( B \) are positive. The order parameter that minimizes the free energy \( \partial F/\partial Q = 0 \) is given by

\[
Q^2 = \frac{a T_{\text{CDW}}}{2B} \left( 1 - \frac{T}{T_{\text{CDW}}} \right). \tag{2}
\]

The entropy \( S \) is derived from the free energy \( \mathcal{F} \), \( S = - \partial F/\partial \mathcal{T} \), and the specific heat at constant pressure is given by \( C_P = \mathcal{T}[\partial S/\partial \mathcal{T}]_P \). There is a jump in the specific heat (Figure 1(a)) at the second-order phase transition \( T_C \) given by [47]

\[
\Delta C_P = \frac{a^2 T_{\text{CDW}}}{2B}. \tag{3}
\]

Discontinuities in the thermal expansion coefficients and the elastic constants are also observed at a second-order phase transition. An example (\( \text{ErTe}_3 \)) is shown in Figures 1(b) and 1(c). The thermodynamic quantities at a second-order phase transition such as a charge density wave phase transition are generally discussed with the Ehrenfest relations reformulated by Testardi [48]. The discontinuity in the thermal expansion coefficients \( \alpha_i \) is related to the specific heat jump \( \Delta C_P \) and to the stress dependence components, \( \partial T_{\text{CDW}}/\partial \sigma_i \), at the phase transition \( T_{\text{CDW}} \):

\[
\Delta \alpha_i = - \Delta C_P \frac{\partial T_{\text{CDW}}}{V_m T_{\text{CDW}}} \frac{\partial \sigma_i}{\partial \sigma_i}, \tag{4}
\]

where \( i = 1, 2, \) and 3 correspond to the \( \hat{\alpha}, \hat{b}, \) and \( \hat{c} \) crystallographic axes directions and \( V_m \) is the molar volume.

The elastic constant component \( \Delta \alpha_i \) is related to the elastic velocity \( V_{ij} \) by \( \Delta \alpha_i = \rho \mathcal{V}^2_{ij} \), \( \rho \) being the mass density. The discontinuities of the elastic constants \( \Delta \alpha_i \) (or velocity \( \Delta \alpha_i /\alpha_i \) at a second-order phase transition are related to the stress dependence \( \partial T_{\text{CDW}}/\partial \sigma_i \) by

\[
\frac{\Delta \alpha_i}{\alpha_i} = \frac{\rho \mathcal{V}^2_{ij}}{V_m T_{\text{CDW}}} \left( \frac{\partial T_{\text{CDW}}}{\partial \sigma_i} \right)^2. \tag{5}
\]

The term, \( \rho \mathcal{V}^2_{ij} \alpha \Delta \chi \delta \left( \partial^2 T_{\text{CDW}}/\partial \sigma_i^2 \right) \), proportional to the entropy variation and multiplied by the second derivative \( \partial^2 T_{\text{CDW}}/\partial \sigma_i^2 \) [3, 31], is neglected in (5). Isothermal elastic constants must be used in (5). But the adiabatic elastic constants are measured in the MHz range and the adiabatic values are generally used in (5).

From (4) and (5)

\[
\frac{\Delta \alpha_i}{\alpha_i} = \frac{\rho \mathcal{V}^2_{ij} V_m T_{\text{CDW}}}{2 \Delta C_P} \left( \frac{\Delta \alpha_i}{\alpha_i} \right)^2. \tag{6}
\]

Thus the discontinuities in the elastic velocities are proportional to the square of the discontinuities in the expansion coefficients. Typical discontinuities of the specific heat, thermal expansion coefficient, and elastic velocity at the charge density wave transition are shown in Figure 1. The discontinuities of the elastic constants at \( T_{\text{CDW}} \) are evaluated using the extrapolated linear temperature dependence of the high temperature background as shown in Figures 1(a) and 1(b).

2.2. Elastic Constants. CDW materials acquire lattice distortions that are incommensurate with the basic lattice. They form part of a wider field of interest developed in the incommensurate structures [49, 50]. Incommensurate structures may arise with insulators as \( \text{K}_0.3\text{SeO}_3 \) [51]. The structural changes are characterized by a distortion whose wave vector
cannot be expressed by a rational fraction of the lattice vector. The resulting ordered phase is not strictly crystalline and is described by an incommensurate phase.

The amplitude of the modulation increases continuously as the temperature is lowered. The relationship between the crystalline and the modulated phases can be formulated in the framework of the Landau theory [28]. In some materials, as 2H-TaSe₂, the modulation periodicity is temperature dependent and may be lock-in at low temperatures to a value that is commensurate with the periodicity of the basis structure [28, 46]. The lock-in transition is a first-order phase transition and very different in nature from the incommensurate instability [46]. 2H-TaSe₂ undergoes a normal to incommensurate transition (second-order) at 122 K and an incommensurate-commensurate transition (first-order) at 90 K [16]. The transition to the incommensurate structural phase is reflected in the elastic stiffness components analyzed in [51, 52].

In order to explain the stiffening of the elastic constants (velocities) in the ordered phase below the incommensurate structural phase transition, a first approach based on the analysis of the entropy variation around the CDW phase transition \( T_{CDW} \) is proposed in [3]. A second approach was developed by Rhewald [51] based on the Landau phenomenological theory including the interaction between the strain components \( e_i \) and the square of the order parameter \( Q \) [51, 52]. The expansion of the free energy density in power of \( Q^2 \) and \( e_i \) is developed in agreement with the symmetry point group of the material [51, 52].

In the orthorhombic symmetry, for example, the free interaction energy is given by

\[
F_c(e_i, Q) = \left[ g_1 e_1 + g_2 e_2 + g_3 e_3 \right] Q^2 \\
+ \frac{1}{2} \left[ \sum_{i,j} h_{ij} e_i e_j + \sum_{i=4}^6 h_{ii} e_i^2 \right] Q^2,
\]

where \( g \) and \( h \) are the coupling constants.

The interacting terms linear in \( e_i \) and quadratic in \( Q \) as \( g_i e_i Q^2 \) are responsible for a decrease of the longitudinal elastic constant \( C_{ii} \) (velocity \( V_{ii} \)). The decrease of the longitudinal
The specific heat discontinuities $\Delta C_p$ are reported in Tables 1–4 and they are shown as a function of the CDW phase transition temperature $T_{CDW}$ in Figure 2. A linear dependence is expected $\Delta C_p = AT_{CDW}$. The experimental data are situated inside the area determined by the two linear dependence types (1) and (2) (Figure 2). The first line (1) followed by TTF-TCNQ, 2H-TaS$_2$, and 2H-TaSe$_2$ has a larger coefficient $A_1 = 4 \times 10^{-2}$ J/molK$^{-2}$. The second line (2) has a coefficient $A_2 = 3 \times 10^{-3}$ J/molK$^{-2}$, 10 times smaller than $A_1$. This second line is followed approximately by the rare earth tritelluride compounds ErTe$_3$ and TbTe$_3$ at the upper and lower CDW phase transitions (blue circle and black circles). The specific heat discontinuity found at the upper CDW phase transition with LaAgSb$_2$ (red square symbol) is also situated on line (2).

However it should be noted that substantial differences exist between the experimental specific heat results obtained from different groups.

The discontinuities $\Delta \alpha$ of the thermal expansion coefficient in the basal plane at the upper phase transition $T_{CDW1} = 330$ K of TbTe$_3$ were obtained from thermal expansion measurements using X-rays technique by Ru et al. [8]. At the upper phase transition, the incommensurate wave vector is along the $\bar{a}$ axis. Large anisotropic behavior is observed for the thermal expansion along the $\bar{a}$ and $\bar{c}$ axes. The largest discontinuity is observed along the $\bar{c}$ axis [8] and is only reported in Table 1.

The discontinuities $\Delta \alpha$ along the $\bar{a}$ and $\bar{c}$ axes at the lower CDW phase transition $T_{CDW2} = 150$ K of ErTe$_3$ were obtained from the thermal expansion measurements using X-rays technique by Ru [8].
Table 1: Materials (2D CDW) TbTe$_3$, HoTe$_3$, and ErTe$_3$ rare earth tritellurides. Molar volumes are given in cm$^3$, specific heat discontinuities in J/molK, thermal expansion discontinuities in K$^{-1}$, elastic velocity discontinuities in $\Delta V/V$, and measured and calculated elastic constants in GPa and ratios.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Molar volume cm$^3$</th>
<th>$T_{CDW}$ K</th>
<th>Specific heat $\Delta C_p$ J/molK</th>
<th>Thermal expansion coefficient along the $c$ axis $\Delta \alpha_c$ (K$^{-1}$)</th>
<th>Elastic velocity decrease $\Delta V/V$</th>
<th>Elastic constant Measured GPa</th>
<th>calculated $\rho V^2$ GPa</th>
<th>Ratio Calculated/Measured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TbTe$_3$</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>[41] -1.2x10$^{-5}$ [8]</td>
<td>along the $\overrightarrow{a}$ or $\overrightarrow{c}$ axis</td>
<td>-0.01 [41]</td>
<td>C$_{33}$ ~ 50</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HoTe$_3$</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>280</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Along the $\overrightarrow{c}$ axis</td>
<td>-0.025 [43]</td>
<td>C$_{33}$ ~ 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ErTe$_3$</td>
<td>69.7</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>[42] -3.5x10$^{-6}$ [8]</td>
<td>along the $\overrightarrow{a}$ or $\overrightarrow{c}$ axis</td>
<td>-0.015 [42]</td>
<td>C$_{33}$ ~ 50</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Materials (2D CDW) transition metal dichalcogenides 2H-NbSe₂, TiSe₂, 2H-TaSe₂, and 2H-TaS₂. Molar volumes are given in cm³, specific heat discontinuities in J/molK, thermal expansion discontinuities in K⁻¹, elastic velocity discontinuities in ΔV/V, and measured and calculated elastic constants in GPa. Discrepancies exist among the experimental values of the Young modulus; the largest values are only indicated. Ratio = calculated ρV²/experimental elastic constant.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Molar volume cm³</th>
<th>T_{CDW} K</th>
<th>Specific heat ΔC_p J/molK</th>
<th>Thermal expansion coefficient Δα K⁻¹</th>
<th>Elastic velocity decrease ΔV/V</th>
<th>Elastic constant GPa</th>
<th>calculated ρV² GPa</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TiSe₂</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>1.15 [22]</td>
<td>a̅ axis -2.5x10⁻⁶ [19]</td>
<td>along the a̅ axis -0.05 [19]</td>
<td>C₁₁ ~ 90 [20]</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>~10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2H-TaSe₂</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>[24]</td>
<td>a̅ axis -8x10⁻⁶ [25]</td>
<td>a̅ axis -0.0005 [16, 17]</td>
<td>Young modulus</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>~0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2H-TaS₂</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>2.8 [24]</td>
<td>no discountin.</td>
<td></td>
<td>E₁ ~ 120 [16]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3: Materials (1D CDW), quasi-one-dimensional conductors $K_{0.3}MoO_3$, $NbSe_3$, $(TaSe_4)_2$I, and TTF-TCNQ. Molar volumes are given in cm$^3$, specific heat discontinuities in J/molK, thermal expansion discontinuities in K$^{-1}$, elastic velocity discontinuities in $\Delta V/V$, and measured and calculated elastic constants in GPa and ratios.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Molar volume (cm$^3$)</th>
<th>$T_{CDW}$ (K)</th>
<th>Specific heat $\Delta C_p$ (J/molK)</th>
<th>Thermal expansion coefficient $\Delta \alpha$ (K$^{-1}$)</th>
<th>Elastic velocity decrease $\Delta V/V$</th>
<th>Elastic constant $\rho V^2$ (GPa)</th>
<th>Ratio calculated/measured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$K_{0.3}MoO_3$</td>
<td>36.3</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>3.6 [30]</td>
<td>[102] axis $7x10^{-6}$ [31]</td>
<td>[102] axis $-0.02$ [31]</td>
<td>[02] axis Young modulus $250$ [31]</td>
<td>~1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$(TaSe_4)_2$I</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>0.83 [40]</td>
<td>$c$ axis $-1x10^{-6}$ [38]</td>
<td>$c$ axis $-0.001$ [37]</td>
<td>$c_{33}=115$ [37]</td>
<td>~0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$NbSe_3$</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>3 [26]</td>
<td>in plane $-2x10^{-6}$ [25]</td>
<td>$-0.0003$ [27]</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>~0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTF-TCNQ</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>2.5 [35]</td>
<td>No discontinuity [36]</td>
<td>$c$ axis $-0.01$ [37]</td>
<td>Young modulus $E\sim60$ [37]</td>
<td>E~15 [36]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Three-dimensional materials. Molar volumes are given in cm$^3$, specific heat discontinuities in J/molK, thermal expansion discontinuities in K$^{-1}$, elastic velocity discontinuities in $\Delta V/V$, and measured and calculated elastic constants in GPa and ratios.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Molar volume cm$^3$</th>
<th>$T_{C,DW}, T_N$ K</th>
<th>Specific heat J/molK</th>
<th>Thermal expansion coefficient $\Delta \alpha$ K$^{-1}$</th>
<th>Elastic velocity decrease</th>
<th>Elastic Constant GPa</th>
<th>calculated $\rho V^2$ GPa</th>
<th>Ratio calculated/measured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LaAgSb2</td>
<td>62.8</td>
<td>$T_{CDW1}=210$</td>
<td>0.5 [44]</td>
<td>$c$ axis $2.2 \times 10^{-6} -5 \times 10^{-7}$ [44]</td>
<td>No measurement</td>
<td>400 GPa</td>
<td>770</td>
<td>~2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>$T_N=310$</td>
<td>3 [53]</td>
<td>along [100] $-7 \times 10^{-5}$ [54]</td>
<td>along [100] -0.03 [54]</td>
<td>$C_{11}=400$ GPa</td>
<td>770</td>
<td>~2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Advances in Condensed Matter Physics

Similar discontinuities are observed along the \( \overrightarrow{a} \) and \( \overrightarrow{c} \) axes.

Only the values of \( \Delta \alpha \) along the \( \overrightarrow{c} \) axis are reported in Table 1.

(b) Thermal expansion coefficients discontinuities in the basal plane along the \( \overrightarrow{a} \) and \( \overrightarrow{c} \) axes obtained at the CDW transitions on transition metal dichalcogenides 2H-NbSe\(_2\) [18, 19], TiSe\(_2\) [20], and 2H-TaSe\(_2\) [25] are reported in Table 2. Very different experimental results were found for 2H-NbSe\(_2\) [18, 19].

(c) Thermal expansion discontinuities \( \Delta \alpha \) determined along the [102] directions in NbSe\(_3\) [25], K\(_{0.3}\)MoO\(_3\) [31, 32], (TaSe\(_4\))\(_2\)I [39], and TTF-TCNQ [38] are reported in Table 3.

(d) Finally the thermal expansion discontinuities along the \( \overrightarrow{c} \) axis observed in LaAgSb\(_2\), at the upper (\( T_{CDW1} = 210 \) K) and lower CDW phase transition (\( T_{CDW2} = 185 \) K) [44] are reported in Table 4. Thermal expansion discontinuity along the \( \overrightarrow{a} \) axis observed at the spin density wave transition \( T_{SDW} = 310 \) K for chromium [54] is also reported in Table 4.

The stress dependence deduced using (4) from the thermal expansion coefficient discontinuities \( \Delta \alpha \) measured at \( T_{CDW} \) along one crystallographic direction is given by

\[
\frac{\partial T_{CDW}}{\partial \sigma} = -\Delta \alpha \frac{V_m}{\frac{T_{CDW}}{\Delta C_p}}
\]

(10)

The stress dependence \( \partial T_{CDW}/\partial \sigma \) values deduced at \( T_{CDW} \) from the values given in Tables 1–4 are reported versus the transition temperature \( T_{CDW} \) in Figure 3. It seems that \( \partial T_{CDW}/\partial \sigma \) increases with increasing \( T_{CDW} \). The high values of the stress dependence \( \partial T_{CDW}/\partial \sigma \) are found with the rare earth tritellurides and 2H-NbSe\(_2\). Such a high value \( \partial T_{CDW}/\partial \sigma \sim 100 \) K/GPa obtained for TbTe\(_3\) is in agreement with the value \( dT_{CDW}/dp = 85 \) K/GPa obtained in the hydrostatic measurements [15]. Smaller (one order of magnitude smaller) values of the stress dependence \( \partial T_{CDW}/\partial \sigma \) are found with the transition metal dichalcogenide compounds and the quasi-one-dimensional conductors.

It results in the fact that a high lattice anharmonicity is responsible for such a large stress dependence of \( T_{CDW} \) observed in the rare earth tritelluride materials.

3.3. Elastic Constant (Velocity) Anomaly at the CDW Phase Transition. The steplike decrease of the longitudinal elastic
velocity $\Delta V_{33}/V_{33} = \Delta C_{33}/2C_{33}$ along the $\bar{c}$ axis measured at the upper and lower CDW phase transitions in the rare earth tritelluride TbTe$_3$ [41], ErTe$_3$ [42], and HoTe$_3$ [43] compounds is reported in Table 1.

The sound velocity and the Young modulus E discontinuities (velocity discontinuity deduced from E is given by $\Delta V/V = \Delta E/2E$) were measured in the $a$-$b$ plane at the CDW phase transition in dichalcogenides 2H-NbSe$_2$ [16, 17], TiSe$_2$ [20], 2H-TaSe$_2$ [16, 17], and 2H-TaS$_2$ [16, 17], in quasi-one-dimensional conductors K$_{0.3}$MoO$_3$ [31, 33] and (TaSe$_4$)$_2$I [39] (Tables 2 and 3).

Two different values $\Delta V/V \sim 0$ and $\sim 0.01$ (dotted black line in Figure 4) are reported for the organic conductor TTF-TCNQ [36, 37]. The discontinuity measured at the SDW phase transition ($T_N = 310$ K) of Chromium [54] is also reported in Table 4. All the absolute values $\Delta V/V$ are shown in Figure 4.

Very small values are reported for 2H-TaSe$_4$ and (TaSe$_4$)$_2$I. A general tendency is observed: the amplitude of the sound velocity discontinuities increases with $T_{CDW}$. We mention that large discrepancies exist among the experimental Young modulus values.

3.4. Consistency. The consistency of Ehrenfest relations (1) and (2) may be checked by evaluating the value $\rho V^2$, equivalent to an effective elastic constant, from the discontinuities $\Delta V/V$, $\Delta \alpha$, and $\Delta C_p$ measured at the CDW phase transition from different experiments following (6) which is rewritten as

$$\left[\rho V^2\right]_{\text{calculated}} = 2 \frac{1}{V_m (\Delta \alpha)^2} \left[ - \frac{\Delta V}{V} \right] \frac{\Delta C_p}{T_{CDW}}$$

(II)

The values $\rho V^2$ evaluated using (II) with different materials are indicated in Tables 1–4.

A realistic value of about 20 GPa is found for the rare earth tritelluride compounds TbTe$_3$ and ErTe$_3$. An unrealistic value of about 5000 GPa is evaluated with the very small thermal expansion jump value, $\Delta \alpha \sim 2 \times 10^{-7}$ K$^{-1}$, measured with 2H-NbSe$_2$ in [18]. In contrast the thermal expansion results, $\Delta \alpha \sim 3 \times 10^{-6}$ K$^{-1}$, reported in [19] give a value $\sim 35$ GPa. A realistic value 250 GPa is evaluated for K$_{0.3}$MoO$_3$ in [31]. A smaller value of 37 GPa is obtained for the one-dimensional conductor (TaSe$_4$)$_2$I. In contrast large values 1800 GPa and 800 GPa are obtained for TiSe$_2$. A small value of about 16 GPa is evaluated for 2H-TaSe$_2$. No discontinuity, $\Delta \alpha \sim 0$, is observed for TTF-TCNQ and $C_{\text{calculated}}$ given by (II) cannot be evaluated for this material (Table 3). Finally a realistic value $C_{\text{calculated}}$ is evaluated (see (II)) at the SDW phase transition in chromium which has been previously discussed in [53–55]. The ratio values between $C_{\text{calculated}}$ and the measured elastic constant are shown in Figure 5.
In conclusion the Ehrenfest equations are approximately satisfied by several materials: the rare earth tritellurides TbTe$_3$ and ErTe$_3$, the transition metal dichalcogenide 2H-NbSe$_2$, and the one-dimensional conductors K$_{0.3}$MoO$_3$ and (TaSe$_4$)$_2$I. In the same manner the Ehrenfest equations are quantitatively satisfied at the SDW phase transition temperature $T_{\text{SDW}}$ satisfied by several materials: the rare earth tritellurides are normalized at $T=0$ where $Q(0)$ is proportional to $[\Delta V/V]_0$ (column 10 in Tables 1–4), $C_{\text{calculated}}/C_{\text{measured}} \sim 1$ indicates that the Ehrenfest relations are approximately satisfied.

The temperature dependence of the velocity $\Delta V/V$ of the longitudinal modes measured in the different materials is reported in Figure 6. All the experimental data follow the temperature dependence of the amplitude of the charge density wave $\Delta V/V$ as a function of the reduced temperature $T/T_{\text{CDW}}$ for 2H-NbSe$_2$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=32 K$ [16, 17]. The blue dashed curve is calculated with 0.0017$[(Q(T)/Q(0))_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1]$ for 2H-NbSe$_2$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=32 K$ [16, 17]. The black circles are values for ErTe$_3$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=260 K$ [42]. The black circles are values for ErTe$_3$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=260 K$ [42].

The increase of the elastic velocity $\Delta V/V$ below $T_{\text{CDW}}$ shown by the dotted black line in Figure 1(b) is related to the square of the order parameter $Q(T)$ (see (9)). $\Delta V/V$ is analyzed with the following relation:

$$\frac{\Delta V}{V} = \left[ \frac{\Delta V}{V} \right]_0 \left( \frac{Q(T)}{Q(0)} \right)^2$$  \hspace{1cm} (12)

where $Q(0)$ is the value of the order parameter at $T=0 K$ and $[\Delta V/V]_0$ is the maximum value of the relative velocity at $T=0 K$ and $\Delta V/V = 0$ at $T_{\text{CDW}}$. For simplicity all the data are normalized at $T=0$ where $\Delta V/V = 0$. It results in the fact that (12) is changed by

$$\frac{\Delta V}{V} = \left[ \frac{\Delta V}{V} \right]_0 \left\{ \left( \frac{Q(T)}{Q(0)} \right)^2 - 1 \right\}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)

The temperature dependence of the velocity $\Delta V/V$ of the longitudinal modes measured in the different materials is reported in Figure 6. All the experimental data follow the temperature dependence of the square of the BCS order parameter $[Q(T)/Q(0)]_{\text{BCS}}^2$ [1]:

$$\frac{\Delta V}{V} = \left[ \frac{\Delta V}{V} \right]_0 \left\{ \left[ \frac{Q(T)}{Q(0)} \right]_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1 \right\}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (14)

The blue dashed curve is calculated with 0.0017$[(Q(T)/Q(0))_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1]$ for 2H-NbSe$_2$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=32 K$ [16, 17]. The pink dashed curve is calculated with 0.0086$[(Q(T)/Q(0))_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1]$ for 2H-TaSe$_2$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=75 K$ [16, 17]. The black dashed curve is calculated with 0.014$[(Q(T)/Q(0))_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1]$ for TTF-TCNQ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=50 K$ [36] and the violet dashed curve with 0.06$[(Q(T)/Q(0))_{\text{BCS}}^2 - 1]$ for TiSe$_2$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=200 K$ [20]. The black circles are values for ErTe$_3$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}=260 K$ [42].

A remarkable feature is the increase of the amplitude $[\Delta V/V]_0$ with $T_{\text{CDW}}$, $[\Delta V/V]_0 \sim 10^{-6} \times T_{\text{CDW}}^2$, in Figure 7. It yields the fact that the order parameter $Q(0)$ proportional to $[\Delta V/V]_0^{0.5}$ increases with the charge density wave transition temperature $T_{\text{CDW}}$ in agreement with the BCS theory.

In conclusion the temperature dependence of the elastic velocity is compatible with the BCS behavior in agreement with the temperature dependence of the amplitude of the
Advances in Condensed Matter Physics

1.2.1

Figure 7: Color online. Amplitudes of the square of the order parameter $Q^2_0$ at $T = 0K$, which is proportional to the values $[\Delta V/V_0]_0$ deduced from Figure 6, are reported as a function of $T_{CDW}$. The solid line increases as $T_{CDW}^2$.

Superlattice reflections and of the intensities of the Raman modes [1, 8, 14].

4. Conclusions

Similar features in the thermodynamic properties at the CDW phase transition $T_{CDW}$ are found in all the CDW materials under review. The amplitude of the specific heat anomaly at the CDW phase transition $T_{CDW}$ is sample dependent but the amplitude increases (roughly) linearly with increasing $T_{CDW}$ in agreement with a second-order phase transition. The (mean field theory) Ehrenfest equations are approximately satisfied by several compounds: the rare earth tritellurides TbTe$_3$, ErTe$_3$ compounds, the transition metal dichalcogenide 2H-NbSe$_2$ compound, and several quasi-one-dimensional conductors. In contrast large inconsistency in the Ehrenfest relationships is found with the transition metal dichalcogenide compounds 2H-TaSe$_2$ and TiSe$_2$. Lattice anharmonicity acting through the stress dependence of the phase transition temperature $T_{CDW}$ in the rare earth tritelluride compounds is larger than that of the transition metal dichalcogenides and quasi-one-dimensional conductors.

It seems that the elastic property in the CDW ordered phase is related to the temperature dependence of the order parameter which follows a BCS behavior. Finally LaAgSb$_2$ has been classified as a 3D CDW system. The Ehrenfest relationships should be verified in this material.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

References


