

Research Article

Prevalence and Risk Factors of Reduced Bone Mineral Density in Systemic Lupus Erythematosus Patients: A Meta-Analysis

Jumei Xia,^{1,2} Ran Luo,¹ Shuiming Guo,¹ Yi Yang¹,¹ Shuwang Ge,¹ Gang Xu,¹ and Rui Zeng¹

¹Department of Nephrology, Tongji Hospital Affiliated with Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, 1095 Jie Fang Avenue, Wuhan 430030, China ²Department of Nephrology, PLA 474 Hospital, Urumqi 830000, China

Correspondence should be addressed to Yi Yang; yangyi0427@126.com

Received 31 July 2018; Accepted 22 January 2019; Published 20 February 2019

Academic Editor: Yves Renaudineau

Copyright © 2019 Jumei Xia et al. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Background. We aimed to conduct a meta-analysis concerning the frequency and risk factors of reduced bone mineral density (BMD) in systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE) with evidence from published studies. *Methods.* A comprehensive literature search was conducted based on the EMBASE, Web of Science, PubMed, and Cochrane Library databases up to March 5th, 2017. Eligible studies reported any prevalence of reduced BMD in SLE patients. All risk factors with odds ratios or risk ratios associated with reduced BMD were extracted. *Results.* 71 reports with 33527 SLE patients were included. Low BMD, osteopenia, and osteoporosis at any site were presented, respectively, in 45%, 38%, and 13% of the SLE patients. The prevalence of osteoporosis increased with the advancing of age, while U-shaped associations between age and the prevalence of low BMD and osteopenia were found. Lumbar spine was indicated to have higher prevalence of osteoporosis. Age, disease duration, drugs use, and many other factors were identified as predictors of reduced BMD. *Conclusion*. Low BMD, osteopenia appeared to be prevalent in patients with SLE. Risk factors of reduced BMD were various.

1. Introduction

Nowadays the long-term complications of systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE) have become great concerns as the survival of SLE has improved dramatically [1]. Publications have shown that patients with SLE have an increased risk of developing reduced bone mineral density (BMD) [2, 3]. The frequency of osteopenia according to WHO criteria is reported to be from 24% to 74% [4, 5] and osteoporosis is from 1.4% to 68.7% [3, 6, 7] in SLE patients. However, most of them are single-center studies and the outcomes vary widely.

Risk factors associated with decreased BMD are still under debate in SLE patients. SLE occurs commonly in females [8, 9]. Women are known to have high prevalence of osteoporosis and osteoporotic fractures [10]. Long-term use of corticosteroid, immunosuppressives, and other drugs, SLE disease damage, and menopause status all might have an effect on bone loss. Osteoporosis is a prevalent complication of SLE and it may lead to increased morbidity and mortality [11, 12]. The reported risk factors from different studies differ greatly [13–15].

The aim of this study was to conduct a meta-analysis concerning the frequency and risk factors of osteopenia, osteoporosis, or low BMD in SLE patients with evidence from published studies.

2. Materials and Methods

This study was conducted according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis (PRISMA) Checklist [16] (Supplementary 1. S1 file).

2.1. Literature Search Strategy. We performed a comprehensive literature search based on the PubMed, Web of Science, Cochrane Library, and EMBASE up to March 5th, 2017. We used the keywords including "(Systemic Lupus Erythematosus or SLE)" and "(risk factors or outcomes or Prevalence)" and "(bone mineral density or bone density or Osteoporosis or Osteopenia or Fracture)" (Supplementary 2. S2 file). Moreover, we hand-searched the reference lists of all identified eligible papers and relevant narrative reviews for additional relevant studies. Titles and abstracts were screened to identify potentially relevant studies; of these, full texts were reviewed. The full text of an article was assessed if there was any doubt to the eligibility of it. Two of the authors (Y.Y. and J.M.X) independently undertook literature search and study selection using a standardized approach. Reviewers were not blinded to study authors or outcomes. Any inconsistencies were resolved by discussion or by consulting a third author (S.W.G.).

2.2. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria. We included published original articles and data on prevalence of decreased bone density, osteoporosis, or osteopenia in SLE patients. There was no restriction of language. Letter, review, conference abstract, editorial material, comment, case report, metaanalysis, and book chapter were excluded. If two articles from the same population reported different data, we included both of them. Otherwise, if the articles reported the same prevalence, we included the article with the larger sample size. In a longitudinal study that reported prevalence of decreased bone density in different time points, we included the baseline data.

2.3. Data Extraction. We extracted the information of interest by two authors (Y.Y. and J.M.X) from each study including study characteristics (study group name, publication year, sample size, age at baseline, female%, SLEDAI, SLICCR/ACR/SDI, BMI, proportion of postmenopausal status, proportion of corticosteroid ever user, mean cumulative corticosteroid dose, age at disease onset, SLE duration, and SLE diagnostic criteria) and any prevalence (data to calculate it) of low BMD (defined as the prevalence of low BMD, or the sum of osteoporosis and osteopenia, or 100%-normal; or if only osteoporosis or osteopenia was reported, defined as the prevalence of osteoporosis or osteopenia) in SLE patients at any part of body. We classified the prevalence according to different sites and different degree of decreased bone density. If a study measured three or more sites of any one patient and gave whole prevalence of osteoporosis, osteopenia, or low BMD for this population or reported the prevalence without stating the sites, we classified this prevalence as "at any site."

2.4. Statistical Analysis. Heterogeneity of prevalence across included studies was examined using χ^2 based on Q-statistical test and quantified by I² index. Roughly, heterogeneity was considered significant at P<0.10 and Higgins I² values of 25%, 50%, and 75% were considered low, moderate, and high inconsistencies. Results of studies were pooled by random-effects models in the presence of high heterogeneity among our studies. All analyses and graphs were made using Stata 10.0 (College Station, TX, USA) and GraphPad Prism 6. P values < 0.05 by two-tailed test were considered significant.

3. Results

3.1. Study Search and Basic Characteristics. We identified 1233 articles by systematic electronic searches; 70 of those were eligible for this meta-analysis. And 1 study was included through hand-searching the reference lists of all identified eligible papers (flow diagram for selection of studies as Figure 1). References and characteristics of studies included in this meta-analysis were listed in Supplementary 3. S3 file and Supplementary 4. S4 file, respectively. 33527 SLE patients (female: 90.2%, postmenopausal: 31.6%) with an overall average age of 43.5 years were eligible for inclusion. The mean disease duration was 8.5 years, the mean SLEDAI score was 4.7, and mean SLICC damage index was 1.1. Percentage of steroids ever used was demonstrated in 36 studies and the mean percentage was 78.8%. Mean cumulative dose of steroids was 20.6 gram. More than half the studies (38/71) were published after 2010. Of the included studies, prevalence of low BMD, osteopenia, and osteoporosis was, respectively, reported in 57, 60, and 46 studies; decreased prevalence of bone density of lumbar spine, femur, total hip, and any one site was respectively reported in 32, 20, 22, and 52 studies.

3.2. Prevalence of Decreased Bone Density in Different Sites and Patients. The pooled prevalence of low BMD, osteopenia, and osteoporosis at different skeletal sites for all patients and postmenopausal and premenopausal patients was represented in Table 1. The heterogeneity was high for most of the subgroup analyses. The prevalence of low BMD, osteopenia, and osteoporosis was 45% (38, 51), 38% (31, 45), and 13% (11, 16), respectively. Compared to premenopausal patients, postmenopausal patients had relatively higher prevalence of low BMD in all sites. Lumbar spine was indicated to have higher prevalence of osteoporosis.

3.3. Exploring the Potential Risk Factors. Figure 2 showed the three models of prevalence by age for osteoporosis, osteopenia, and low BMD at any site. The prevalence of osteoporosis increased with the advancing of age, while U-shaped associations between age and the prevalence of low BMD and osteopenia were found. Age might have influence on bone health.

The association between potential risk factors and low BMD, osteoporosis, and fracture in SLE patients from the literature search was shown in Table 2. Postmenopausal status, non-Afro-Caribbean, higher BMI z score, number of deliveries, ever taken prednisolone >10 mg/day, and maximal dosage of >50 mg/day of oral corticosteroids were significantly associated with low BMD, while menopause, disease duration, and prednisone use were associated with osteoporosis. The risk factors for fractures were disease duration, taken osteoporosis medications, age, higher BMI, history of previous bone fracture, corticosteroids use, seizures, cerebrovascular events, and SLICC/ACR-DI.

4. Discussion

In the current meta-analysis, as expected, the prevalence of low BMD at any site in SLE patients was high (45%), no matter



FIGURE 1: Flow chart of the systematic review.

in premenopausal patients (40%) or in postmenopausal patients (43%). The prevalence of osteopenia in all patients and premenopausal patients and postmenopausal patients was 38%, 42%, and 25%, while prevalence of osteoporosis was 13%, 9%, and 21%, respectively.

Higher prevalence of osteoporosis was shown at lumbar spine (13%) compared with the femur (6%) and hip (4%) in our study, which was consistent with some observational studies [2, 3, 17]. Lumbar spine was also reported to have high risk of fracture in SLE patients [9]. The mechanism for this discrepancy might be due to the widespread use of glucocorticoids for SLE therapy and the variable composition of each bone [18]. Trabecular bone is mainly affected by intensive glucocorticoid treatment [19], and the lumbar spine is mainly composed of trabecular bone. Low BMD and fracture of lumbar spine might have disastrous consequences. So, enough attention, timely examination, and effective intervention should be given to the bone density for SLE patients. Several factors may explain the prevalence of low BMD in SLE patients.

First, SLE was a chronic autoimmune disease with multiorgan inflammation. The mean disease duration of SLE was 8.5 years and the mean SLEDAI score was 4.6 in our analysis. There were many disease-related variables playing a role in bone health. Increasing of tumor necrosis factor- α [20], interleukin-6 [21], and interleukin-1 [22] in the serum had an effect on the stimulation of bone resorption and inhibition of bone formation [23].

Second, corticosteroid therapy was frequent among SLE patients. From our literature search, the percentage of corticosteroid use was reported to be from 51.6% [24] to 100% [25, 26] (mean percentage: 78.8%; mean cumulative dose: 20.6 gram) and glucocorticoid use was reported to be associated with fractures [14, 27], osteoporosis [28, 29], and low BMD [30–32] in SLE patients. The mechanism might be that corticosteroid could inhibit the formation and function of

		All patie	ents			Premenopaus	sal patients			Postmenopau	sal patients	
Variable	Number of studies	Sample size	Prevalence (95% CI)	I^2	Number of studies	Sample size	Prevalence (95% CI)	I^2	Number of studies	Sample size	Prevalence (95% CI)	I^2
Osteopenia												
Spine	26	2951	35% (33, 38)	51.8%	4	264	29% (22, 37)	45.7%	4	189	37% (30,44)	0.0%
Femur	15	1290	43% (38, 47)	66.0%	3	164	24% (17, 31)	0.0%	4	189	53% (38, 68)	74.8%
Total hip	15	2293	35% (27, 42)	92.7%	2	174	16% (11, 20)	0.0%	2	122	53% (26, 80)	88.0%
Any site	34	3319	38% (31, 45)	95.2%	8	502	42% (31, 52)	85.1%	3	234	25% (2, 48)	95.7%
Osteoporosis												
Spine	28	3317	13% (10, 15)	86.8%	6	512	13% (7, 19)	83.5%	4	189	27% (16, 37)	61.7%
Femur	15	1389	6% (5, 8)	8.0%	4	234	5%(2,8)	4.2%	4	189	7% (2, 13)	54.3%
Total hip	15	2078	4% (3, 5)	63.7%	2	174	1% (-0, 3)	0.0%	2	122	12% (6, 18)	0.0%
Any site	42	29543	13% (11, 16)	90.8%	10	613	9% (5, 12)	73.0%	3	234	21% (11, 31)	74.0%
Low BMD												
Spine	29	3283	48% (43, 53)	89.2%	6	552	43% (32, 55)	88.9%	3	171	71% (56, 86)	79.2%
Femur	18	1602	47% (35, 59)	96.6%	IJ	257	39% (27, 51)	75.6%	4	189	61% (51, 71)	50.8%
Total hip	19	2686	36% (26, 46)	97.4%	4	301	16% (11, 20)	23.0%	2	122	65% (43, 83)	84.0%
Anv site	40	5171	45% (38, 51)	96 6%	16	1179	40% (29 51)	95 1%	c	153	730% (22 63)	86.0%

_	
ંત્વં	
š	
, d	
a	
<u>ρ</u>	-
0	
ē	
G	
d	
- 8	
e.	
2	
<u>0</u>	
ă	
1	
š	
ਸ਼	
ö	
5	7
ž	
Ĕ	
2	
S	
<u> </u>	-
2	
H	
(D	
Ś	
Ħ	
9	
<u>e</u> .	
a	
Ω	
r+1	
щ	
S	
_	
_	
·=	
\sim	
- H	
- 7	
-	
5	
- P	
<u> </u>	
- H	
d Ic	
nd lc	
and lc	
, and lo	
s, and lo	
sis, and lo	
osis, and lo	
rosis, and lo	
orosis, and le	
porosis, and le	
oporosis, and le	
eoporosis, and le	
teoporosis, and lo	
steoporosis, and lo	
osteoporosis, and lo	
r, osteoporosis, and lo	
ia, osteoporosis, and lo	
nia, osteoporosis, and lo	
ania, osteoporosis, and lo	
cenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
openia, osteoporosis, and lo	
sopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
teopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
steopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
f osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
e of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
ce of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
rce of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
ence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
lence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
alence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
valence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
evalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
revalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
e prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
he prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
f the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
s of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
is of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
sis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
lysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
alysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
nalysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
a-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
sta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
feta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
Meta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
Meta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	
1: Meta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
3 1: Meta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and le	
LE 1: Meta-analysis of the prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and lo	

	TABL	E 2: Risk factors for red	luced b	one mineral (lensity in patien	ts with SLE from the literat	ure search.	
Study (first author, year)	Country	Study design	Size	Female (%)	Mean age (y)	Outcome	Risk factor	Estimate (aOR, 95% CI)
LAKSHMINARAYANAN et al. 2001	USA	Prospective cohort	92	100	32.8	Low BMD	Menopause	3.32 (1.45, 7.62)
Yee et al. 2004	UK	Case control	242	95.5	39.9	Low BMD	Non-Afro-Caribbean ever taken prednisolone >10	2.5 (1.2, 5.4) 2.1 (1.1, 4.2)
							mg/day	1 E4 (0 60 3 46)
							Autoan American face Age at SLE diagnosis	0.98 (0.95, 1.01) 0.98 (0.95, 1.01)
							BMI	0.90(0.84, 0.96)
I EE 24 21 2007	T TC A		000	10.0	1 07		Drink caffeine	1.33(0.53, 3.36)
LEE et al. 2007	N5A	Case control	867	100	42.1	том ијр Бици	SDI	1.30(1.08, 1.57)
							SLE renal disease	$0.79\ (0.33, 1.87)$
							Current use of GC	1.48(0.71,3.09)
							Study center	0.95(0.42, 2.15)
							African American race	4.42(2.19, 8.91)
							Age at SLE diagnosis	$0.96\ (0.93,\ 0.99)$
							BMI/ kg/m2	$0.93\ (0.89,\ 0.98)$
I EF	T TC A		000	001	1 0 1		Drink caffeine	$0.34\ (0.17,0.72)$
LEE el al. 2007	NOA	Case control	067	100	47.1	Low Jumbar spine bivit	SDI	1.06(0.89, 1.26)
							SLE renal disease	1.50(0.71, 3.16)
							Current use of GC	1.54(0.81, 2.92)
							Study center	0.71(0.33, 1.53)
							Number of deliveries	5 58 (1 31 JE 0E)
Furukawa et al. 2011	Japan	Case control	58	100	44.0	Low BMD	Maximal dosage of >50	0.25 (0.07 0.91)
							mg/day of oral GC	(1/10, (10.0) (2.0
Lim et al. 2011	Canada	Retrospective cohort	80	82.5	14.2a	Low BMD	Higher BMI z score	0.35(0.18, 0.69)
Donff of al 2015	D ****!	Cons control	365	10.0	37 0		Current GC use	3.97(1.51, 10.41)
DUILIA EL AL. ZULO	DIAZII	Case culled of	CDC	100	0.70	TOW DIVID	Osteoprotegerin 245 T>G	2.14(1.02, 4.50)
							NPT1	1.03(1.01 - 1.05)
Common of al 2015	Brazil	Drocharting rohort	63	100	311	I our BMD	Cumulative GC	1.00(1.00-1.00)
oegulu el al. 2013	DIAZII	riospective conort	C0	100	1.10	LUW DIVIL	Mean GC	$1.0\ (0.95, 1.04)$
							Maximum GC	0.98(0.95, 1.01)
							Age	1.06(1.04, 1.08)
							Female	$^{*}0.47~(0.23, 1.00)$
							Cumulative ACR criteria	$^{*}0.80\ (0.63, 1.02)$
							SDI excluding Osteoporosis	$^{*}1.43$ (1.12, 1.82)
Cramarossa et al. 2016	Canada	Prospective cohort	286	88.8	38.0	Low BMD	Vitamin D use	$^{*}1.63\ (0.94,\ 2.80)$
							Calcium use	$^{*}1.63\ (0.94,\ 2.80)$
							Bisphosphonates use	$^{*}1.72~(0.85, 3.47)$
							Immunosuppressives use	$^{*}1.51(0.90,2.52)$
							Cumulative GC dose	1.04(1.01, 1.07)
Lacassagne et al. 2007	Canada	Prospective cohort	64	76.6	14.3	Osteopenia	Cumulative GC dose	1.003(1.001, 1.01)

				TABLE 2:	Continued.			
Study (first author, year)	Country	Study design	Size	Female (%)	Mean age (y)	Outcome	Risk factor	Estimate (aOR, 95% CI)
							Disease duration/month	1.031 (0.99, 1.073)
							BMI/kg/m2	$0.78\ (0.53, 1.16)$
Makatal 2011	Singapor	Case control	110	87	40 E	Octaonania	Cyclosporine use	$0.014\ (0.00, 1.01)$
INTAR OF ALL ZUIT	omgapui	Case CUILLU	011	10	C.04	Osteopenna	Cumulative GC dose	1.080(0.85, 1.38)
							FMD/%	$0.147 \ (0.02, 0.96)$
							Carotid IMT/mm	0.000(0.000)
	Ital	Constant and	10	10.0	30 E	Octoorcorocio	Disease duration/year	1.2(1.07, 1.33)
MINICAGETTA EL AL 1999	٨ıbıı	Case control	04	100	C.UC	Osteoporosis	Prednisone/year-use	1.16 (1.05, 1.29)
Banno et al. 2002	Japan	Case control	60	100	34.8	Osteoporosis	Cumulative GC intake	1.06(1.01, 1.11)
$\mathbf{V}_{00} \propto \mathbf{v}_1 = 1$	1112		CVC	05 5	20.0	Octoororoio	Menopause	13.3 (1.6, 111.1)
Ice el al. 2004	40	Case colling	242	C.CK	6.60	Osteoporosis	Age/year	1.0(1.0, 1.1)
I acassama at al 2007	Canada	Drochartiva rohort	61	76.6	1/ 3	Octannaracie	Disease duration/year	1.60(1.18, 2.18)
Lacassague et al. 2001	Callana	r ruspective currut (14	0.07	L11.U	Corenharia	lupus nephritis	$8.79\ (0.96, 80.24)$
Crosslin et al. 2011	USA	Case control	14829	90.5	47.3	Osteoporosis	Male	0.65(0.43, 0.97)
Ajeganova et al. 2015	Sweden	Case control	222	89	48.7	Osteoporosis	Carotid plaque	1.78 (0.97, 3.24)
Note: OR, odds ratio; USA, U International Collaborating C adjusted risk ratio.	Inited States of <i>I</i> linics/American	umerica; BMD, bone miner College of Rheumatology-	ral density; U Damage Ind	JK, the United Kin ex; GC, glucocortic	ıgdom of Great Brita coid; NPT1, N-termiı	uin and Northern Irelan nal propeptide of type 1	d; BMI, Body mass index; SLICC/AC collagen; FMD, flow-mediated dilatat	CR-DI, the Systemic Lupus tion. Hint: ^a median; [*] aRR:



FIGURE 2: Prevalence of osteoporosis, osteopenia, and low BMD at any site by age for all SLE patients from the literature search.

osteoblast [33, 34], increase osteoclast, and inhibit absorption of calcium [35, 36], as well as affecting glucocorticoid induced leucine zipper proteins [37], 11 β -hydroxysteroid dehy- drogenase type 1 [38], and other associated proteins to induce bone loss.

Third, postmenopausal status could lead to bone loss. In our study, postmenopausal patients (31.6% of all patients) showed higher prevalence of osteopenia, osteoporosis, and low BMD in almost all sites. Most of our SLE patients undergo early menopause, which may be due to SLE disease per se or its treatment with cytotoxic substances [39, 40]. Postmenopausal status was known as a risk factor of bone loss because of lacking estrogen, which affected the balance of bone formation and resorption metabolism through series of receptors and cytokines [41–45]. Postmenopausal status was reported to be associated with increased risk of low BMD (adjusted OR=3.32, 95% CI: 1.45-7.62) [46] and osteoporosis (adjusted OR=13.3, 95% CI: 1.6-111.1) [31]. Hence, it was necessary to place emphasis on the bone health for postmenopausal SLE patients.

Fourth, degeneration of bone increased with age. Older age was independently associated with bone loss in both general population [47] and SLE patients [2, 31]. Older age was also reported to be related to fracture [14, 48]. The overall average age of our included patients was 43.5 years and prevalence of osteoporosis increased with age. U-shaped associations between age and the prevalence of low BMD and osteopenia were found. For early-onset lupus and young patients, other factors, such as higher SLE disease index and inflammatory disease itself [49, 50], might influence the bone health. Similarly, we found that SLEDAI increased with the decreasing of age. In a word, age

Other risk factors might have effects on bone health in SLE patients. (1) The use of antimalarials might influence cytokines, lysosomal membranes, DNA, antigen processing, and other mechanisms that might lead to loss of bone. (2) The effect of body mass index (BMI) was still under debate. It was reported to be associated with increased risk of vertebral fracture (adjusted OR=1.17, 95% CI: 1.02-1.33) [48], but Lee et al. did not obtain the association with fracture (adjusted OR=1.01, 95% CI: 0.952-1.07) [12]. Meanwhile, higher BMI z score was associated with decreased risk of low BMD (adjusted OR=1.17, 95% CI: 1.02-1.33). More well-designed studies were needed to explore the association between BMI and bone loss. (3) Race, disease duration, the Systemic Lupus International Collaborating Clinics/American College of Rheumatology (SLICC/ACR) Damage Index, and many other risk factors were all reported to have associated with bone loss or fracture [27, 28, 31, 51].

We acknowledged some limitations of our analyses. Firstly, BMD measurements were performed in SLE patients with different disease duration. Secondly, the treatments for patients varied greatly. Thirdly, the differences regarding race, genetics, geographical locations, and lifestyle across the different population studied were not well considered. Fourthly, few studies reported the bone condition in male SLE patients, so we failed to extrapolate gender-related differences. Finally, the heterogeneity was high for most of the analyses.

5. Conclusions

SLE patients were at a great risk of developing low BMD, especially in lumbar spine and the postmenopausal patients. The risk factors that associated with low BMD might include low body weight, menopause duration, age, and disease-related factors.

Data Availability

All relevant data are within the paper and its Supplementary Materials files.

Ethical Approval

Given that this is a protocol for a meta-analysis and it is based on published data, there is no requirement for ethical approval.

Disclosure

It is anticipated that dissemination of results will take place at conferences and through publication in a peer-reviewed journal.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Authors' Contributions

Yi Yang conceived and designed the study. Jumei Xia and Yi Yang screened the abstract and full text, extracted data, assessed studies, and drafted the manuscript. Ran Luo assisted in statistical analyses. Jumei Xia, Yi Yang, Ran Luo, Shuiming Guo, Shuwang Ge, and Gang Xu drafted the manuscript. All authors read the manuscript and approved the final version.

Acknowledgments

This project was funded by Major Research Plan of the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant no. 91742204), international (regional) cooperation and exchange projects (NSFC-DFG, Grant no. 81761138041), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grants 81470948, 81670633, and 81570667), national key research and development program (Grant 2016YFC0906103), and the National Key Technology R&D Program (Grants 2013BAI09B06 and 2015BAI12B07).

Supplementary Materials

Supplementary 1. S1 file: PRISMA 2009 Checklist.

Supplementary 2. S2 file: Search strategy to identify studies with data on prevalence of reduced bone density in SLE patients.

Supplementary 3. S3 file: References of studies included in the meta-analysis.

Supplementary 4. S4 file: Characteristics of included studies.

References

- R. Cervera, M. A. Khamashta, J. Font et al., "Morbidity and mortality in systemic lupus erythematosus during a 10-year period: a comparison of early and late manifestations in a cohort of 1,000 patients," *Medicine*, vol. 82, no. 5, pp. 299–308, 2003.
- [2] K. Almehed, H. Forsblad d/Elia, G. Kvist, C. Ohlsson, and H. Carlsten, "Prevalence and risk factors of osteoporosis in female SLE patients—extended report," *Rheumatology*, vol. 46, no. 7, pp. 1185–1190, 2007.
- [3] Y. N. Sun, X. Y. Feng, L. He et al., "Prevalence and possible risk factors of low bone mineral density in untreated female patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *BioMed Research International*, vol. 2015, Article ID 510514, 7 pages, 2015.
- [4] S. S. Yeap, A. Z. Othman, A. A. Zain, and S. P. Chan, "Vitamin D levels: Its relationship to bone mineral density response and disease activity in premenopausal Malaysian systemic lupus erythematosus patients on corticosteroids," *International Journal of Rheumatic Diseases*, vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 17–24, 2012.
- [5] C. C. Mok, A. Mak, and K. M. Ma, "Bone mineral density in postmenopausal Chinese patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Lupus*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 106–112, 2005.
- [6] M. Furukawa, C. Kiyohara, H. Tsukamoto et al., "Prevalence of and risk factors for low bone mineral density in Japanese female patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Rheumatology International*, vol. 31, no. 3, pp. 365–376, 2011.

- [7] M. Boyanov, R. Robeva, and P. Popivanov, "Bone mineral density changes in women with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Clinical Rheumatology*, vol. 22, no. 4-5, pp. 318–323, 2003.
- [8] J. D. Alele and D. L. Kamen, "The importance of inflammation and vitamin D status in SLE-associated osteoporosis," *Autoimmunity Reviews*, vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 137–139, 2010.
- [9] I. E. M. Bultink, W. F. Lems, P. J. Kostense, B. A. C. Dijkmans, and A. E. Voskuyl, "Prevalence of and risk factors for low bone mineral density and vertebral fractures in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Arthritis & Rheumatism*, vol. 52, no. 7, pp. 2044–2050, 2005.
- [10] K. Kerschan-Schindl, J. Patsch, S. Kudlacek, A. Gleiss, and P. Pietschmann, "Measuring quality of life with the German osteoporosis quality of life questionnaire in women with osteoporosis," *Wiener Klinische Wochenschrift*, vol. 124, no. 15-16, pp. 532–537, 2012.
- [11] K. Almehed, S. Hetényi, C. Ohlsson, H. Carlsten, and H. Forsblad-d'Elia, "Prevalence and risk factors of vertebral compression fractures in female SLE patients," *Arthritis Research & Therapy*, vol. 12, no. 4, p. R153, 2010.
- [12] C. Lee, O. Almagor, D. D. Dunlop et al., "Association between African American race/ethnicity and low bone mineral density in women with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Arthritis Care & Research*, vol. 57, no. 4, pp. 585–592, 2007.
- [13] S. H. L. Lim, S. M. Benseler, P. N. Tyrrell et al., "Low bone mineral density is present in newly diagnosed paediatric systemic lupus erythematosus patients," *Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases*, vol. 70, no. 11, pp. 1991–1994, 2011.
- [14] S. Ekblom-Kullberg, H. Kautiainen, P. Alha, M. Leirisalo-Repo, and H. Julkunen, "Frequency of and risk factors for symptomatic bone fractures in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Scandinavian Journal of Rheumatology*, vol. 42, no. 5, pp. 390–393, 2013.
- [15] S. Ajeganova, T. Gustafsson, T. Jogestrand, J. Frostegard, and I. Hafstrom, "Bone mineral density and carotid atherosclerosis in systemic lupus erythematosus: a controlled cross-sectional study," *Arthritis Research & Therapy*, vol. 17, article 48, 2015.
- [16] D. Moher, A. Liberati, J. Tetzlaff, D. G. Altman, and The PRISMA Group, "Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement," *PLoS Medicine*, vol. 6, no. 7, Article ID e1000097, 2009.
- [17] T. C. Salman-Monte, V. Torrente-Segarra, M. Almirall, P. Corzo, S. Mojal, and J. Carbonell-Abelló, "Prevalence and predictors of vitamin D insufficiency in supplemented and nonsupplemented women with systemic lupus erythematosus in the Mediterranean region," *Rheumatology International*, vol. 36, no. 7, pp. 975–985, 2016.
- [18] S. L. Bonnick, "Current controversies in bone densitometry," *Current Opinion in Rheumatology*, vol. 14, no. 4, pp. 416–420, 2002.
- [19] K. Natsui, K. Tanaka, M. Suda et al., "High-dose glucocorticoid treatment induces rapid loss of trabecular bone mineral density and lean body mass," *Osteoporosis International*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 105–108, 2006.
- [20] Y. Tanaka, K. Watanabe, M. Suzuki et al., "Spontaneous production of bone-resorbing lymphokines by B cells in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Journal of Clinical Immunology*, vol. 9, no. 5, pp. 415–420, 1989.
- [21] M. Linker-Israeli, R. J. Deans, D. J. Wallace, J. Prehn, T. Ozeri-Chen, and J. R. Klinenberg, "Elevated levels of endogenous IL-6

in systemic lupus erythematosus: a putative role in pathogenesis," *Journal of Immunology (Baltimore, Md: 1950)*, vol. 147, no. 1, pp. 117–123, 1991.

- [22] M. Al-Janadi, S. Al-Balla, A. Al-Dalaan, and S. Raziuddin, "Cytokine profile in systemic lupus erythematosus, rheumatoid arthritis, and other rheumatic diseases," *Journal of Clinical Immunology*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 58–67, 1993.
- [23] B. R. MacDonald and M. Gowen, "Cytokines and bone," British Journal of Rheumatology, vol. 31, no. 3, pp. 149–155, 1992.
- [24] J. Jacobs, L.-A. Korswagen, A. M. Schilder et al., "Six-year follow-up study of bone mineral density in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Osteoporosis International*, vol. 24, no. 6, pp. 1827–1833, 2013.
- [25] H. C. Chong, S. S. Chee, E. M. L. Goh, S. K. Chow, and S. S. Yeap, "Dietary calcium and bone mineral density in premenopausal women with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Clinical Rheumatology*, vol. 26, no. 2, pp. 182–185, 2007.
- [26] X. L. Tang, T. Y. Zhu, V. W. Hung et al., "Increased organ damage associated with deterioration in volumetric bone density and bone microarchitecture in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus on longterm glucocorticoid therapy," *The Journal of Rheumatology*, vol. 39, no. 10, pp. 1955–1963, 2012.
- [27] I. E. M. Bultink, N. C. Harvey, A. Lalmohamed et al., "Elevated risk of clinical fractures and associated risk factors in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus versus matched controls: a population-based study in the United Kingdom," Osteoporosis International, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 1275–1283, 2014.
- [28] L. Sinigaglia, M. Varenna, L. Binelli et al., "Determinants of bone mass in systemic lupus erythematosus: a cross sectional study on premenopausal women," *The Journal of Rheumatology*, vol. 26, no. 6, pp. 1280–1284, 1999.
- [29] S. Banno, Y. Matsumoto, T. Naniwa et al., "Reduced bone mineral density in Japanese premenopausal women with systemic lupus erythematosus treated with glucocorticoids," *Modern Rheumatology*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 323–328, 2002.
- [30] M. Furukawa, C. Kiyohara, T. Horiuchi et al., "Prevalence and risk factors of vertebral fracture in female Japanese patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Modern Rheumatology*, vol. 23, no. 4, pp. 765–773, 2013.
- [31] C.-S. Yee, N. Crabtree, J. Skan et al., "Prevalence and predictors of fragility fractures in systemic lupus erythematosus," *Annals* of the Rheumatic Diseases, vol. 64, no. 1, pp. 111–113, 2005.
- [32] A. C. Bonfá, L. P. C. Seguro, V. Caparbo, E. Bonfá, and R. M. R. Pereira, "RANKL and OPG gene polymorphisms: associations with vertebral fractures and bone mineral density in premenopausal systemic lupus erythematosus," *Osteoporosis International*, vol. 26, no. 5, pp. 1563–1571, 2015.
- [33] X. Xia, R. Kar, J. Gluhak-Heinrich et al., "Glucocorticoidinduced autophagy in osteocytes," *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research*, vol. 25, no. 11, pp. 2479–2488, 2010.
- [34] K. Hayashi, T. Yamaguchi, S. Yano et al., "BMP/Wnt antagonists are upregulated by dexamethasone in osteoblasts and reversed by alendronate and PTH: potential therapeutic targets for glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis," *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications*, vol. 379, no. 2, pp. 261–266, 2009.
- [35] K. Kaneko and S. Kawai, "Mechanisms and therapeutics of glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis," *Japanese Journal of Clinical Immunology*, vol. 34, no. 3, pp. 138–148, 2011.
- [36] M.-H. Kim, G.-S. Lee, E.-M. Jung, K.-C. Choi, and E.-B. Jeung, "The negative effect of dexamethasone on calcium-processing

gene expressions is associated with a glucocorticoid-induced calcium-absorbing disorder," *Life Sciences*, vol. 85, no. 3-4, pp. 146–152, 2009.

- [37] T. Lekva, J. Bollerslev, C. L. Kristo, O. K. Olstad, T. Ueland, and R. Jemtland, "The Glucocorticoid-Induced Leucine Zipper gene (GILZ) expression decreases after successful treatment of patients with endogenous cushing's syndrome and may play a role in glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis," *The Journal of Clinical Endocrinology & Metabolism*, vol. 95, no. 1, pp. 246–255, 2010.
- [38] L. Wu, H. Qi, Y. Zhong et al., "11β-hydroxysteroid dehydrogenase type 1 selective inhibitor BVT.2733 protects osteoblasts against endogenous glucocorticoid induced dysfunction," *Endocrine Journal*, vol. 60, no. 9, pp. 1047–1058, 2013.
- [39] I. Cunha, M. J. Saavedra, J. A. P. da Silva, and A. Malcata, "Cyclophosphamide induced amenorrhoea in pre-menopausal women with Systemic Lupus Erythema," *Acta Reumatólogica Portuguesa*, vol. 33, no. 1, pp. 69–76, 2008.
- [40] P. K. Chugh, "Management of women with systemic lupus erythematosus," *Maturitas*, vol. 75, no. 3, pp. 207–214, 2013.
- [41] L. F. Shapiro and K. Freeman, "The relationship between estrogen, estrogen receptors and periodontal disease in adult women," *Journal of the Michigan Dental Association*, vol. 96, no. 11, pp. 40–44, 2014.
- [42] M. Martin-Millan, M. Almeida, E. Ambrogini et al., "The estrogen receptor-α in osteoclasts mediates the protective effects of estrogens on cancellous but not cortical bone," *Molecular Endocrinology (Baltimore, Md)*, vol. 24, no. 2, pp. 323–334, 2010.
- [43] T. d. Tera, R. F. Prado, A. C. De Marco, M. P. Santamaria, and M. A. Jardini, "The RANK/ RANKL/ OPG interaction in the repair of autogenous bone grafts in female rats with estrogen deficiency," *Brazilian Oral Research*, vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 1–9, 2014.
- [44] N. Charatcharoenwitthaya, S. Khosla, E. J. Atkinson, L. K. McCready, and B. L. Riggs, "Effect of blockade of TNF-α and interleukin-1 action on bone resorption in early postmenopausal women," *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research*, vol. 22, no. 5, pp. 724–729, 2007.
- [45] S.-K. Lee, Y. Kadono, F. Okada et al., "T lymphocyte-deficient mice lose trabecular bone mass with ovariectomy," *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research*, vol. 21, no. 11, pp. 1704–1712, 2006.
- [46] S. Lakshminarayanan, S. Walsh, M. Mohanraj, and N. Rothfield, "Factors associated with low bone mineral density in female patients with systemic lupus erythematosus," *The Journal of Rheumatology*, vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 102–108, 2001.
- [47] J. Gong, M. Tang, B. Guo, J. Shang, Y. Tang, and H. Xu, "Sexand age-related differences in femoral neck cross-sectional structural changes in mainland Chinese men and women measured using dual-energy X-ray absorptiometry," *Bone*, vol. 83, pp. 58–64, 2016.
- [48] E. K. Li, L. S. Tam, J. F. Griffith et al., "High prevalence of asymptomatic vertebral fractures in Chinese women with systemic lupus erythematosus," *The Journal of Rheumatology*, vol. 36, no. 8, pp. 1646–1652, 2009.
- [49] F. Formiga, I. Moga, M. Pac, F. Mitjavila, A. Rivera, and R. Pujol, "Mild presentation of systemic lupus erythematosus in elderly patients assessed by SLEDAI. SLE Disease Activity Index," *Lupus*, vol. 8, no. 6, pp. 462–465, 1999.
- [50] M. Fernández, G. McGwin Jr., A. M. Bertoli, J. Calvo-Alén, and G. S. Alarcón, "Systemic lupus erythematosus in a multiethnic cohort (LUMINAXXXIX): relationship between hormone

replacement therapy and disease activity over time," *Lupus*, vol. 15, no. 9, pp. 621-622, 2006.

[51] J. A. Paupitz, G. L. Lima, J. C. Alvarenga, R. M. Oliveira, E. Bonfa, and R. M. R. Pereira, "Bone impairment assessed by HR-pQCT in juvenile-onset systemic lupus erythematosus," *Osteoporosis International*, vol. 27, no. 5, pp. 1839–1848, 2016.



The Scientific World Journal

Journal of Immunology Research



Research and Practice











BioMed Research International



PPAR Research

Journal of Ophthalmology



Computational and Mathematical Methods in Medicine



International



Behavioural Neurology



Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine







Research and Treatment





Oxidative Medicine and Cellular Longevity



Submit your manuscripts at www.hindawi.com