# Peer Review Checklist

We have created this checklist to provide you with guidance on peer reviewing a manuscript. This list should serve as a guide and is not intended to be exhaustive.



# Introduction

This checklist provides a list of requirements for all manuscripts that can be considered suitable for publication. It is important that each of these points are considered prior to returning a reviewer report and if any points are not met, these should be addressed appropriately by the authors before proceeding to publication.

This list should serve as a guide and is not intended to be exhaustive. As a reviewer, it is important to have a thorough understanding of the manuscript prior to making a recommendation.

Concerns and clarifications that can be addressed by a revision should be detailed in your report, which will be sent to the authors. More serious concerns which you feel should be raised directly to the editor should be provided in the confidential notes section. Any research integrity concerns should be raised to our dedicated team (publication.ethics@hindawi.com) who can provide expert advice.

# Contents

| All manuscripts            | 1 |
|----------------------------|---|
| Research articles          | 3 |
| Review articles            | 3 |
| Case reports / case series | 4 |
| Reporting guidelines       | 4 |

# All manuscripts

#### **First look**

- The content of the manuscript is communicated clearly and appropriately.
- The manuscript is in scope for the journal.
- The manuscript addresses a valid research question.
- The language is suitable for the journal.

#### Title

- The title provides a clear indication of the focus of the manuscript.
- The title is concise.

#### Abstract

- The abstract is self-contained, citation-free, and not exceeding 300 words.
- The abstract is an accurate summary of the aims, methods, findings and conclusions.
- The abstract can be read and understood on its own, separately from the full text of the manuscript.

#### Introduction

- The introduction clearly summarises the current state of the topic.
- The introduction clearly defines the aim of the study, and this is consistent with the rest of the manuscript.

#### Main text

- The main ideas or findings of the manuscript are clearly presented.
- The study design and approach has been sufficiently described and appropriately addresses the research question.
- The authors have included all essential information required to support the findings presented in the manuscript.
- The research conducted is ethical, particularly considering research on animals and humans.

#### **Tables and Figures**

- All figures and tables are clear and accurately represent the results.
- All tables and figures are cited consecutively in the text.
- All figures and tables have a descriptive title, clearly explaining what is presented.

#### References

- All key references are included, with no clear omissions of essential references that are required to support statements in the manuscript.
- There are no inappropriate citations, for example, those that are not directly supporting a statement or claims, or any excessive citations to any researcher (author, editor, reviewer) or journal.

The below lists show additional items that could be considered, depending on article type

## Research articles

- The research question is valid.
- The methods and study design are appropriate for answering the research question.
- The reporting of methods, including any equipment and materials, is sufficiently detailed so that the research can be reproduced.
- It is clear how samples were collected/how participants were recruited. Any potential biases are clearly presented and discussed.
- All experiments have appropriate controls.
- All statistical tests are used appropriately and correctly reported.
- The results are presented clearly and accurately.
- All conclusions are supported by the data presented.
- The conclusions are presented in the context of existing knowledge.
- All significant limitations are clearly presented and discussed.

## Review articles

- The review is a balanced and unbiased overview of current understanding and knowledge.
- All key references are included, with no clear omissions of essential references that are required to support statements in the manuscript.
- A wide range of source literature is assessed, with no focus on any particular researcher (including the authors themselves).
- The interpretation and presentation of any results from existing publications are accurate and precise.

## Case reports/case series

- The study is suitable for the case report article type. A case report should present no more than 3 individual cases, while a case series can be used to present larger numbers.
- The patient(s) clinical presentation and diagnosis are clearly presented.
- Any treatments are clearly detailed, and clinical outcomes are clearly described.
- The patient(s) are sufficiently anonymised and any potentially identifiable information provided is consistent with the consent statement provided.
- The conclusions are specific to the context of the case(s) presented and do not attempt to make more generalised conclusions for which an alternative study design would be required.

# Reporting guidelines

Hindawi does not mandate the use of reporting guidelines by authors, however, we encourage reviewers to use relevant reporting guidelines to help assess the submission. The <u>EQUATOR</u> Network provides clinical guidelines, while <u>FAIRsharing</u> list clinical and general science guidelines. We particularly encourage the use of:

- <u>CONSORT</u> for randomized controlled trials
- TREND for non-randomized trials
- PRISMA for systematic review and meta-analyses
- <u>CARE</u> for case reports
- <u>STROBE</u> for observational studies
- <u>STREGA</u> for genetic association studies
- <u>SRQR</u> for qualitative studies
- <u>STARD</u> for diagnostic accuracy studies
- ARRIVE for animal experiments

If you have questions about a manuscript you are reviewing, please direct them to your Editorial Assistant, or contact <u>help@hindawi.com</u>.